

Broadmoor Police Protection District

Minutes of the September 17, 2025 Regular Meeting (Rescheduled from September 9, 2025)

1. **Call to Order:** Meeting is called to order at 7:02 p.m. Commissioner Aguerre leads Pledge of Allegiance.
2. **Roll Call:** Commissioners Aguerre, Hall, and Hutchens are present. Sergeant Gabriel Carroll, Counsel Davis, and members of the public are also present.
3. **Public Comment:** (a) John Aguerre, in his capacity as a private individual, extends his condolences to the Fraternal Order of Peace Officers. He states he recently attended the 77th Annual Fire, Police, Sheriffs, and Park Rangers ceremony at St. Cecilia's church in San Francisco. He recites a prayer for St. Michael, the patron saint of law enforcement officers, from a prayer card he received at the ceremony.

(b) Kathryn Slater Carter, President of the Harbor District Board and the Montara Water & Sanitary District, but speaking in her capacity as a private citizen and former nearby business owner, notes that the District continues to lack remote access for its meetings and urges the Commission to adopt a solution to allow the community remote access to the meetings for greater transparency and accessibility. She states that this is the only meeting she has attended recently that does not have a Zoom or other electronic meeting option, noting the lack of parking at the facility and suggesting that broadcasting meetings is now standard practice. She offers to provide contact information for district managers who could assist with implementation.

(c) Officer Matthew Carroll, President of the Broadmoor Police Officers Association, raised concerns about Commissioner Hall's conduct at the last meeting and offered an Instagram post about her recently deceased cat as evidence of a "current social media account" and one of Commissioner Hall's "little lies." Commissioner Hall responds that she recognizes that Officer Carroll has "a lot of strong emotions," and she is interested in hearing more about the source of those emotions from Officer Carroll, but she does not believe this is an appropriate forum. Officer Carroll responds that Commissioner Hall is lying and obfuscating the truth. Commissioner Aguerre advises that "we are not going back and forth."

(d) Francis Hall, Broadmoor resident and Commissioner Hall's father, states that his recollection of the prior meeting differs from Officer Carroll's account, and he believes Officer Carroll has "behaved inappropriately."

4. Chief of Police Report (delivered by Sergeant Carriel)

Sergeant Carriel reports on recent incidents, including a vandalism case at Ben Franklin, where the suspect was taken into custody, and a vehicle theft that morning, where the vehicle was quickly recovered and the suspect apprehended and taken to the county jail. He reports no significant crime trends. Commissioner Hall asks about the stabbing at Daly City BART earlier in the day. Sergeant Carriel clarified that Broadmoor PD did not respond but monitored on radio, noting it was a BART investigation and appeared to be an isolated incident rather than a random

act.

5. Consent Agenda

Commissioner Aguerre pulls the meeting minutes and Treasurer's Report from the consent agenda for individual consideration.

5(a) Approval of Minutes from March 11, 2025 Regular Meeting:

Commissioner Hall objects to edits proposed by Commissioner Aguerre, stating she continues to not understand the source or driving force behind the edits and cannot vote for the proposed draft minutes. Commissioner Hutchens states the Commission needs to "get on top of" approving the backlog of minutes. Commissioner Aguerre explains his revisions are intended to remove subjective bias. Commissioner Hall questions why Commissioner Aguerre removed an item that occurred after the meeting was called to order from the March minutes, asking how that reflects subjective bias. Commissioner Aguerre responds, "[t]hat's a fair point."

Kathryn Slater Carter suggests that the Commissioners attend the California Special Districts Association training on secretary duties and consider action-only minutes; Commissioner Hall responds she will not use action minutes until the District records or broadcasts meetings and that she has already registered to attend.

First Vote on Unrevised March 11, 2025 Minutes:

- Motion by Commissioner Hall to approve the minutes she submitted in her capacity as the Board's duly elected secretary
- Second by Commissioner Hutchens
- Roll Call: Hutchens (Aye), Hall (Aye), Aguerre (Nay) - Motion passes 2-1

Commissioner Hutchens then requests to recall his vote, having misunderstood the motion.

Motion to Recall Prior Vote:

- Motion by Commissioner Aguerre
- Second by Commissioner Hutchens
- Roll Call: Hutchens (Aye), Hall (Nay), Aguerre (Aye) - Motion passes 2-1

Second Vote on Unrevised March 11, 2025 Minutes:

- Motion by Commissioner Hall to approve the minutes she submitted in her capacity as the Board's duly elected secretary
- Second by Commissioner Hutchens
- Roll Call: Hutchens (Nay), Hall (Aye), Aguerre (Nay) - Motion fails 1-2

Vote on March 11, 2025 Minutes Revised By Chair Aguerre:

- Motion by Commissioner Aguerre to approve his alternative version to allegedly remove "subjective bias" and citations to the Government Code
- Second by Commissioner Hutchens
- Roll Call: Hutchens (Aye), Hall (Nay), Aguerre (Aye) - Motion passes 2-1

5(b) Approval of Minutes from April 8, 2025 Regular Meeting:

Commissioner Hall questions specific edits including Commissioner Aguerre's decision to change "He reports that the district is working to use software to compile crime statistics to use predictive policing" to just "Chief Connolly reports that crime in Broadmoor remains low," asking where the subjective bias exists in reporting what the Chief stated. Commissioner Aguerre responds, "My comments are designed to be general, and I really don't have anything else to add."

Vote on Unrevised April 8, 2025 Minutes:

- Motion by Commissioner Hall to approve the minutes she submitted in her capacity as the Board's duly elected secretary
- No second - Motion dies

Vote on April 8, 2025 Minutes Revised by Chair Aguerre:

- Motion by Commissioner Aguerre to approve the version of the minutes he has taken upon himself to revise.
- Second by Commissioner Hutchens
- Roll Call: Hutchens (Aye), Hall (Nay), Aguerre (Aye) - Motion passes 2-1

5(c) Approval of Minutes from April 30, 2025 Regular Meeting:

Commissioner Hall questions why Chair Aguerre has changed her minutes from stating that a resident "expresses concern about factual support for statements regarding voter disenfranchisement in the accompanying staff report" to say he expressed concern about the lack of factual support for statements regarding voter disenfranchisement in the accompanying staff report, Mr. Burchins inquired whether any additional data or information is available to substantiate those claims." She asks Chair Aguerre how the failure to include the extra sentence expresses bias. Chair Aguerre concedes "[t]hat is not necessarily biased."

Vote on Unrevised April 30, 2025 Minutes:

- Motion by Commissioner Hall to approve the minutes she submitted in her capacity as the Board's duly elected secretary
- No second - Motion dies

Vote on Revised April 30, 2025 Minutes:

- Motion by Commissioner Aguerre to approve the version of the minutes he has taken upon himself to revise.
- Second by Commissioner Hutchens
- Roll Call: Hutchens (Aye), Hall (Nay), Aguerre (Aye) - Motion passes 2-1

5(d) Approval of Minutes from May 13, 2025 Regular Meeting:

Commissioner Hall asserts the revisions are inappropriate and undermine her authority as secretary, stating that if Commissioner Aguerre wanted to draft the minutes, he ought to have nominated himself to be secretary. Commissioner Aguerre responds that "in general terms, for all these minutes, I am just looking to have an objective summary of items and business specific to the district."

Vote on Unrevised May 13, 2025 Minutes:

- Motion by Commissioner Hall to approve the minutes she submitted in her capacity as the Board's duly elected secretary
- No second - Motion dies

Vote on Revised May 13, 2025 Minutes:

- Motion by Commissioner Aguerre to approve the version of the minutes he has taken upon himself to revise.
- Second by Commissioner Hutchens
- Roll Call: Hutchens (Aye), Hall (Nay), Aguerre (Aye) - Motion passes 2-1

5(d) Approval of Minutes from June 10, 2025 Regular Meeting:

Commissioner Hall states that she continues to believe Chair Aguerre's edits to her minutes "have no reasonable or rational basis, that they are based in personal animus against me and a lack of respect for my position here as secretary, and consequently, a lack of respect for the people here and their right to transparency."

Vote on Unrevised June 10, 2025 Minutes:

- Motion by Commissioner Hall to approve the minutes she submitted in her capacity as the Board's duly elected secretary
- No second - Motion dies

Vote on Revised June 10, 2025 Minutes:

- Motion by Commissioner Aguerre to approve the version of the minutes he has taken upon himself to revise.
- Second by Commissioner Hutchens
- Roll Call: Hutchens (Aye), Hall (Nay), Aguerre (Aye) - Motion passes 2-1

5(f) Approval of Minutes from August 12, 2025 Regular Meeting:

After a collaborative discussion, the Commission agrees to several corrections, including:

- Adding "District" before "Counsel Davis" in roll call
- Writing out "Peace Officers Standards and Training" for the POST acronym
- Correcting Christine Aguerre's hyphenated last name to "Taliva-Aguerre"
- Removing three lines regarding Government Code Section 3206
- Correcting spelling of "Hutchens" throughout

Vote on August 12, 2025 Minutes with Agreed Revisions:

- Motion by Commissioner Hall to approve with discussed edits
- Second by Commissioner Aguerre
- Roll Call: Hutchens (Aye), Hall (Aye), Aguerre (Aye) - Motion passes 3-0

5(g) Treasurer's Report - September 2025 Warrants and Deposits:

Commissioner Hall notes the District is paying for an officer to attend the academy and commends this as a positive step. Sergeant Carroll provides details about the future officer who started as a reserve officer and will graduate from the academy September 29th, bringing the District one more full-time officer. He notes the competitive environment for recruiting, with all

unaffiliated academy attendees being recruited by agencies, but states this individual specifically wants to work for Broadmoor.

Vote on September 2025 Treasurer's Report:

- Motion by Commissioner Hutchens to accept warrants and deposits
- Second by Commissioner Hall
- Roll Call: Hutchens (Aye), Hall (Aye), Aguerre (Aye) - Motion passes 3-0

6. Regular Business:

6(a) Discussion and Adoption of Proposed Amendments to Commission Policy Handbook:

Commissioner Aguerre recommends continuing this item to the October 2025 meeting pending a staff report in progress.

Motion to Continue:

- Motion by Commissioner Aguerre to continue to October 2025 meeting
- Second by Commissioner Hall
- Roll Call: Hutchens (Aye), Hall (Aye), Aguerre (Aye) - Motion passes 3-0

6(b) Discussion and Action on Changing November Meeting Date:

Because the regular November meeting falls on Veterans Day (November 11, 2025), the Commission discusses alternative dates.

Motion to Reschedule November Meeting:

- Motion by Commissioner Aguerre to move the November meeting to Wednesday, November 12, 2025 at 7:00 p.m.
- Second by Commissioner Hall
- Roll Call: Hutchens (Aye), Hall (Aye), Aguerre (Aye) - Motion passes 3-0

6(c) Temporary Policy Regarding Commissioner Contact with District Personnel:

The item proposes a temporary policy pending adoption of handbook revisions, prohibiting commissioners from direct contact with district personnel except the Chief/District Manager regarding district business, unless personally involved in a matter involving a district officer in an official capacity. Commissioner Hall expresses concerns, including a lack of staff report, undefined terms ("temporary," "direct contact," "district personnel," "district business"), and a potential chilling effect on events such as the recent First Responders Gathering. She also raises concerns about consolidating authority in the Chief/District Manager in light of LAFCO recommendation that the District hire a separate District Manager.

Sergeant Carriel explains the chain of command rationale - that questions should go through proper channels as patrol officers may not have authority or information that supervisors would have. He acknowledges the balance between maintaining order and not being overly restrictive

Francis Hall, Broadmoor Resident and Commissioner Hall's father, questions whether this consolidation of authority undermines the Commission's oversight role.

Kathryn Slater Carter suggests tabling for better definition and specificity, noting vague language opens potential for misinterpretation and disputes.

Commissioner Aguerre states he reads it as applying only to district business matters, not prohibiting casual interactions or community engagement events. Discussion continues about the need for clarification between “request or order” versus “any direct contact.”

Motion to Table:

- Motion by Commissioner Hall to table to October 2025 meeting for staff to refine language
- Second by Commissioner Aguerre
- Roll Call: Hutchens (Aye), Hall (Aye), Aguerre (Aye) - Motion passes 3-0

7. Adjournment:

Commissioner Hutchens moves to adjourn the meeting at 8:57 p.m. Commissioner Aguerre seconds.

Roll Call Vote: Hutchens (Aye), Hall (Aye), Aguerre (Aye) - Motion passes 3-0

Next Meeting: The Commission’s next regular meeting will be October 14, 2025 at 7:00 p.m. at 388 88th Street.

Respectfully submitted,
/s/ Commissioner Andrea M. Hall, Secretary